

Kanji Dwarkadas
Bombay

CONFIDENTIAL

PAKISTAN.

Bolitho, Biographer of British Royalties, spent a week in Bombay in May 1952 on his way back to England from Karachi. He lived over a year in Pakistan as a guest of the Pakistan Government to write an official biography of Jinnah. But Bolitho terminated his contract and returned to England disappointed. He gave me his sad story. He had gone to Karachi with high hopes as the Pakistan Government had promised to give him all the material for the biography. Miss Jinnah and the Pakistan Government not being on friendly terms, she refused to co-operate and she would not give up her copy-right on Jinnah's papers. Bolitho also found that there was very little to write about Jinnah's personal life and there was very little written or known material on Jinnah's earlier years. Bolitho wrote to me from Karachi if I would help him, as he came to know of my friendship and work with Jinnah from 1917 onwards. I replied that I would be interested in his request for help as a business proposition.

Completely baffled in Pakistan for want of co-operation, Bolitho terminated his agreement to write the official biography of Jinnah.

He and I met practically every day during his week's stay in Bombay. He gave me an inside story of Pakistan and the Pakistan Governments - Central and Provincial (Sind) - this was in May 1952 - and the situation was getting from bad

to worse than. Hotels were unclean, food and services bad, roads were dirty and Bolitho told me bitterly: "In creating Pakistan Jinnah had given Karachi people 14 miles of dust and 14 miles of camel dung". There was no discipline, no two members of Government, ministers or permanent service men, worked together, because they could not trust each other. They only agreed negatively and constructive efforts at administrative or administrative level, had come to a stop. Though he was a guest of Government, he never met either the Governor General or the Governor of Sind, nor did any of the ministers of Pakistan or Sind care to meet him. The British expert from England, Bolitho added, who was in Karachi to help the Pakistan Government to draft the Constitution, was also put in cold storage - he was living in the same hotel as Bolitho - because the Pakistan Ministers were not interested in getting the new Constitution passed through the Constituent Assembly and also because they could not agree as to what should be the form of the Constitution. Bolitho said that if Pakistan would never ~~form~~ ^{frame} a new Constitution for that would mean fresh elections on basis of adult franchise and having proclaimed Pakistan to be an Islamic and religious State, they did not know how to adjust that conception of ^{the} State with democracy. From the material that Bolitho was able to collect about Jinnah, he ~~never~~ formed a poor opinion of Jinnah. He called him an "uneducated man" and he said that there was nothing interesting in his personal life.

In the boat coming from Karachi to Bombay Bolitho decided that this was his first and last visit to the

"dirty East" - he would never return to the East again. But twentyfour hours' stay in Bombay made him change this bad impression of the East. He was enchanted with Bombay, with its people, with its free atmosphere, freedom from any kind of suspicion, with the communal amity and harmony and with the friendliness he encountered. Within three days of his being here, I arranged for him talks with the Governor of Bombay, & the Chief Minister, Morarji Desai. He said that their talks with him were frank, friendly and informal in complete contrast to the atmosphere in Karachi and Lahore. Though Bolitho had cancelled his contract with the Pakistan Government to write the official biography he did not want to waste the year which he had spent in Pakistan and he had therefore arranged with a London Publishers for an unofficial biography of Jinnah.

When England and India devalued the pound and the rupee, Pakistan did not follow suit and soon found herself in economic trouble. The Pakistan rupee became too expensive for a flow of trade between India and Pakistan. In the black-market the Pakistan rupee fell and came down to the value of the Indian de-valued rupee. Gulam Mohamed, now Governor General, but then Finance Minister, went to Doshmukh in New Delhi and suggested parity of 109 Indian rupee to Pakistan rupee 100. Doshmukh was inclined to accept this, but Sardar Patel decided against it saying that Pakistan would be compelled to settle at par. This is how the Congress leaders always behave. ^{never} They/know when to clinch on a quick, healthy and profitable compromise. Then came the Korean war and Pakistan's honeymoon

with prosperity went into full swing. Japan and Pakistan are the two countries in the world which profited by the Korean war. Prices shot up and India settled the exchange at Rs. 144 (Indian money) to Pakistan Rs. 100/- Pakistan's good luck took a downward trend after July 1951 when the Korean truce parleys began and her economic condition ever since then is going from bad to worse; not only economic, but also the political, army, communal, provincial situations as well. The mad Mullahs having tasted blood of authority and power as a result of Pakistan being advertised as an Islamic religious State went greedy for more authority and power.

The full story of the conspiracy and arrests of the top military leaders for plotting and conspiring against the Pakistan Government has never been told. Followed the murder of Prime Minister Liaqat Ali Khan in Rawalpindi in October 1951 and here again Pakistan Government have not taken the world into their confidence and the mystery of the murder still continues.

Falling prices and sellers market ending followed by scarcity of water through draught and through bad monsoon, Pakistan mureers became whimpering lamentations and it seemed a safe way out for Pakistan was to throw all the blame of their misfortune on India. Jute prices went down and jute cultivation had to be decreased, creating more unemployment. Though the official exchange value between India and Pakistan is still Rs. 144 to 100, the Pakistan rupee has fallen. The Kashmir situation remaining where it is, is doing no good to Pakistan and every day's delay at a settlement at U.N. level of

the Kashmir problem makes India's position in Kashmir stronger in spite of the Jan Sangh (Hindu communal) agitation against Abdullah's Kashmir Government and Nehru.

Strict censorship of Pakistan news in regard to internal problems prevented India and the rest of the world from knowing how bad the internal situation had ~~xxxx~~ become. But such things cannot be kept underground for all time. The storm burst in the shape of anti-Ahmediya riots beginning with Karachi and spreading to Lahore and other parts of West Punjab.

Here is an inside story sent by a cute observer from Pakistan and published anonymously in the papers as if from New Delhi. Army rule has restored order in the Punjab (Pakistan) but it has not brought about any change in the people's thoughts regarding the ~~xxxx~~ various issues which caused a mass uprising in the Province in March. It was a popular revolt but the aims that drove the agitators and the people into it were not identical. Among the agitators themselves there was no unanimity of motives. Religion, personal ambition, desire to impose Punjab hegemony over Pakistan, contempt for Bengalees and economic distress - all these acted as the driving force of the rebellion. Nothing stand out markedly from this/ mass of casual factors, the sordid part played in the movement by the Muslim League politicians of the Punjab.

The rallying point of the up-rising was the anti-Ahmediya agitation not new to the Punjab as the Province has known it for the last fifty years. With the coming into power of the Doulatana Ministry things began to move fast, Doulatana

himself being an ardent anti-Ahmadiya.

The smouldering fire of the anti-Ahmadiya agitation was only waiting for a favourable breeze to blaze into flames. This came with the publication of the Basic Principles Committee's Report. It provided parity between East and West Pakistan and this was too much for the Punjab leaders to accept. Doulatana wrote a minute of dissent and gave it to Nazimuddin, the then Prime Minister who did not take it seriously and did not include it in the Report. The Prime Minister thought that it was too explosive and persuaded Doulatana to agree to its being kept out. Doulatana was chafing and made it public that he had written a minute of dissent advocating unitary system of Government. Later he came out openly with the contents of the note. That started the music. A regular campaign was started against the Basic Principles Committee Report and specially against the Bengali Prime Minister. Under the cover of grow-more-food tours the Punjab prime minister visited almost every village and preached that Pakistan was achieved to enable Muslims to live according to their lights, that the Ahmadiyas were bringing the Prophet into contempt and that therefore "we have no place for them". A slogan was added: "The Bengalses are physically, mentally, educationally and culturally inferior to us and yet they want to dominate us." As far back as October 1952 Doulatana and the Punjab Ministry took up the Ahmadiya question with the Centre ⁱⁿ ~~and~~ Dacca during the session of the Pakistan Muslim League. The Committee shirked the responsibility

of deciding one way or the other in spite of Doulatana's warning them that the anti-Ahmediya feeling was gaining ground every day. He wanted the Centre to take immediate decision in respect of Zafrullah and his co-religionists. A regular press propaganda on a wholesale scale was started a year ago against the Ahmediyas. On January 21st with feeling rising very strong to boiling point the All Muslim Parties Convention met. There were no political parties in it and the "all parties" were Mullahs of different shades. This convention presented an ultimatum for the immediate removal of Zafrullah Khan, the Foreign Minister, the declaration of Qadianis as a non-Muslim minority and their ousting from key positions in the armed and civil services of the country. The Prime Minister and the Mullahs met several times just before the period of ultimatum was over. But nothing came out of these meetings. The Prime Minister was trying to gain time. The convention was now in Karachi and the Punjab Muslim Leaguers were happy that the trouble stood at the very door of the Prime Minister. On January 26th at a public meeting the Convention announced its decision to launch direct action from the very next day. At an eleven hour long session anti-Ahmediya and anti-Nazimuddin speeches were made. The Cabinet including representatives of the Punjab met at mid-night and decided to act.

The main Ulemas were rounded up early in January 27th. Wholesale arrests were made and it was felt that the situation was in hand, but on 3rd March new trouble brewed up in the Punjab. The Wazir Khan Mosque was selected as the

headquarters of the movement. The fourth and fifth of March saw hell let loose in Lahore; Quadianis being special target of mob fury. The police merely looked on and when the position was getting out of control they refused to open fire. The army was summoned but it had ~~xpx~~ strict instructions not to interfere unless told to do so. Doulatana seeing that the situation was getting out of control frantically got in touch with Nazimuddin who told him every time to take strong action and quell the movement. On March 6th exactly ~~after~~ 8 years after the Muslim-Hindu massacres started in Lahore, Doulatana got in touch with Nazimuddin again and read out to him the statement he proposed to issue and what was the statement. Inter-alia it said in categorical terms that the Punjab Government fully supported the agitation and that it was approaching the Central Government through a special messenger to accede to the demands. Nazimuddin asked him to wait for half an hour to give him time to consult his colleagues, but Doulatana did not oblige. He had copies of his statements ready, not in hundreds, but in thousands and they were sent to every mosque in the City. The Information Dept. ~~was~~ of the Government went round the City announcing the surrender. The Punjab Government aircraft was used to distribute the statement from air. It was also broadcast from the Lahore Station of the Radio Pakistan. This meant that the Punjab Government, a subordinate branch of the Pakistan Government, had revolted against the Central Government and joined the rebels who were indulging in mob fury. This was too much for Nazimuddin and his colleagues. The army got instructions to take over the

control of Lahore and Cantonment. Martial law had arrived in Lahore. Doulatana offered to resign, but the Governor General would not accept his resignation and said that he Doulatana might be tried for treason. It was after great hesitation that Nazimuddin and Home Minister Curmani and Defence Minister Khalilur Rehman went to Lahore from Karachi and Doulatana's resignation was accepted.

The crowds that collected in Lahore to defy the Curfew during martial law behaved like fanatics. Young boys hit once by bullet on the arm or leg stood up and shouted: "Not enough - give us another bullet" and the bullet struck them till they were dead. Goonda element took advantage of the situation and began looting indiscriminately, but they did not do much damage to nonqadianis. Several M.L.A.s are under arrest and one was sentenced by Court Martial to nine years rigorous imprisonment. Flogging is one of the punishments - 5 to 40 lashes being awarded in public.

But all is not well even in the army. The ranks have started talking that they have been told it was a communist movement and now they have discovered that the movement was religious. The qadianis versus the nonqadianis feeling is going strong in the army. The qadiani officers have been more severe than non-qadianis during the firing and the Court Martial. The slogans of the Lahore crowds were mostly anti-qadianis, anti-Nazimuddin and anti-Bengali. The future is not bright for the Punjab. The most important point to observe is that what lured the people into agitation is the serious

economic depression. People in the villages say: "Pakistan was to be an Islamic State, but we do not have enough to eat and enough to clothe ourselves with." The slogan in the Punjab today is "What is Pakistan's meaning? Bullets, curfew and martial law."

Rajendra Prasad in his Presidential Address to the ^{Parliament} ~~Legislature~~ in January referred to the improved relationship between India and Pakistan. Nehru had spoken in the same vein and three days back Deshmukh expressed satisfaction that the problem between India and Pakistan were moving satisfactorily to a friendly solution. Last month was concluded a trade agreement between Pakistan and India in regard to lowering of prices of Jute and Coal. The atmosphere in Delhi in regard to Pakistan is one of friendly watchfulness. There is no attempt to gloat over Pakistan's internal difficulties in spite of the press attacks ^{on India.} in Pakistan. Nazimuddin was careful in his ~~xxxx~~ utterances in regard to India.

Pakistan's weakness is India's opportunity, opportunity not to slash and hit, but to show friendship and help. Pakistan's need for help is India's opportunity to render every possible service to Pakistan in distress and I think Nehru fully realises his responsibility. A weak and disintegrated Pakistan is a source of trouble and weakness to India and every effort should be made to help Pakistan to tide over its present critical situation.

The problem in Pakistan can be summed up thus: The trouble is religious, communal and provincial. There is no coherent element which can put the whole ^{of} Pakistan together. It would be pertinent to quote Sardar Patel's letter to me dated March 4, 1947: "If the Muslim League insists on Pakistan, the only alternative is the division of the Punjab and Bengal. They cannot have the Punjab as a whole or Bengal without civil war. I do not think the British Government would agree to division. In the end they would see the wisdom of handing over the reins of Government to the strongest party. Even if they do not do so, they will not help the minority in securing and maintaining division. And a strong Centre with the whole of India except Eastern Bengal and a part of the Punjab, Sind and Beluchistan enjoying full autonomy under the Centre would be so powerful that the remaining portion will come in." Of course, I do not agree with Sardar Patel and he and his congress friends miscalculated. Now Nehru and India have ^{been} permanently reconciled to the existence of their Pakistan neighbour.

It is an irony of fate that the Punjab which supplied wheat to the whole of India and to the army during the critical war years is now running ~~itself~~ short of wheat. Pakistan screams against India in regard to being deprived of canal waters and the matter has been referred to the World Bank. Pakistan has never directly and openly complained of this deprivation of canal water nor it has gone to the U.N. to complain. Pakistan press has been ~~xxxx~~ mad about this question.

Nehru said that it was due to no fault of India that the canal water has not been going to the Punjab. But in his speech three days back in winding up the debate in the Parliament, ^{Deshmukh said} that mistakes might have been made at a lower official level. The trend of Nehru's and Deshmukh's speeches are extremely friendly to Pakistan.

Suddenly so far as India was concerned the bombshell of the change in the Cabinet came on Saturday the 13th morning. Nazimuddin has been replaced by Mohamad Ali who is not very well known either in India or in Pakistan. His qualification is that he comes from East Pakistan ^(Bengal) and it is a sop to Bengalees to make him the Prime Minister. He is not the strong man of the Cabinet, and his being colourless has been an extra qualification. To my mind there is an advantage of his being the Prime Minister, namely, that he has been in U.S. ^{for two years} as Pakistan Ambassador and he is pro-West and a strong anti-communist. But I cannot answer how much influence he wields in regard to Pakistan politics, internal and foreign. Zafrullah has been retained as Foreign Minister. Shuaib Qureshi who was High Commissioner for Pakistan in India, is also in the new Cabinet with the portfolio of Information and Broadcasting and Kashmir Affairs. This is a healthy sign as regards the negotiations between India and Pakistan are concerned on the Kashmir problem. Shuaib Qureshi, about whom an article from me was published in the "Times of India" in October 1952 on the day he became High Commissioner for Pakistan in India, will be well inclined to come to a settlement with India on all

outstanding problems. His appointment as Minister in charge of Kashmir Affairs is a welcome friendly gesture to India.

Last week was murdered in train between Karachi and Secunderbad Mr. Bhimji whom I knew as he was working in ^{and India United} the Sessoon Group of Mills. His brother was in Bombay last week and he gave me the story of what happened. The murder was for the purpose of robbery when he was travelling alone in a first class compartment. The bogie was not looked into and cleaned and was shunted. It was brought back ^{to the station} after two days and when a passenger wanted to enter the compartment found its doors locked. When the door was finally opened the dead body was found, 48 hours after the murder. This explains the neglect in the Pakistan railways. The brother went to the Inspector General of Police in Karachi to ^{ask him to} find out the miscreants. The Inspector General of Police replied that it was useless and impossible to make any investigations. ^{He said:} "Pakistan was a nation of thieves and robbers. There was no discipline, no respect for law and law and order ^{were non-existent}. Not only the present generation is doomed in Pakistan, but the children born and unborn are equally doomed. Schools and colleges have been closed and there is no education, no discipline and it was impossible to trace murderers." This is ^{the} sad story of Pakistan and as things are I am afraid the troubles are not over with the formation of the new Cabinet. Pakistan will have to go through much worse blood bath and I see no other way there except a strong military dictatorship on the lines of Egypt. But Pakistan will continue to be weak and if the cold war ends and I

peace

hope it will from the world's [~]point of view, then the three victims of Peace would be Chiang-kai-Shek, Rhee of South Korea and countries like Pakistan.

Kaaj Dwarakadas
20 April 1953

Since this note was written four days back, friendly messages have been exchanged between the New Prime Minister and Nehru. Mohamad Ali has got off with a good start. The Indian Press and the leaders and the people have shown feelings of sympathy and friendship towards Pakistan. Shuaib Quereshi, the Minister for Kashmir Affairs, flew to New Delhi, and met Dr. Radhakrishna, Vice-President and Nehru.

But good feelings and words and good intentions cannot cover and make up for the terrible internal conditions, economic and political. The Muslim League has split to pieces.

Gulam Mohamad, the Governor General, is an old Civil Service man. I know him very well. He has more friends in India than in Pakistan. He is an able administrator, and understands that Pakistan and India should be friends and work together in mutual trust. But he is sick, a "dying man", suffering from severe heart trouble and ~~may pass away any day.~~ Another able and sound man is Mohamad Ali, the Finance Minister, but he too has heart trouble and has to take things easy. The intrigues of disappointed politicians, corrupt and inefficient, will further complicate the internal situation. Unemployment, poverty, want of food, and disgruntled refugees - in thousands and scores of thousands - make the problem well-nigh hopeless. I wonder how much U.S., U.K. and India understand the seriousness, and how much they can help.

Ka

24.4.53